TABLE OF CONTENTS

3........ SUMMARY

4........ CSL BACKGROUND

6.......... THE WORKSHOP

6.......... Workshop Objective

6.......... Workshop Structure

6.......... Overview of Key Workshop Conclusions

7.......... Summary of Identified Next Steps

8.......... Summary of Feedback on Working Groups’ Recommendations

10......... Overview of Workshop: Day 1 and Day 2

10......... Workshop Day 1

13......... Workshop Day 2

17.......... APPENDICES

17......... Appendix 1: Workshop Agenda

19......... Appendix 2: List of Participating Organizations

20......... Appendix 3: Overview of 2019 CSL Working Groups

22......... Appendix 4: Media Summary

23......... Appendix 5: Points of Contact and Links to Learn More
SUMMARY

The Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods (CSL) held a participatory workshop from October 30 to 31, 2019 in Medan, Indonesia. The objective: to further advance the CSL as an initiative supporting sustainable livelihoods within the Indonesian provinces of Aceh and North Sumatra. Over 130 representatives from across private sector, government and civil society organizations, together with CSL’s initial supporting partners, participated in sessions purposely designed to support active engagement and collaboration. In a showing of support for CSL, H. Musa Rajekshah, Vice Governor of North Sumatra, officially opened the workshop and set the stage for the opportunity ahead.

The 2019 workshop built on the progress made since the launch of CSL in September 2018, where participants identified the development of working groups as critical to addressing key needs moving forward. Thus, in the lead up to the 2019 workshop, the CSL established five working groups focused on the key thematic areas requiring attention: governance, metrics, growth, and one for each district initiative: Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan. Between August and October 2019, the working groups successfully conducted a total of 14 meetings with over 90 participants from across government, private sector and civil society. Following each group’s discussion, the working groups drafted recommendations for action and investment to guide how CSL should move forward in relation to each thematic topic.

All of the working groups presented their recommendations during the 2019 workshop, with time for discussion to gather input for refinement and finalization. This led to clear recommended Action and Investment Plans (included in page 20) which will guide phase 3 implementation of the CSL. High level follow-ups from the workshop are summarized on page 7 under the ‘Summary of Identified Next Steps.’

By encouraging active participation from diverse stakeholders, the workshop facilitated trust-building, collaboration and a sense of collective ownership for achieving results and driving CSL’s success. The workshop also created space for stakeholders to cultivate new opportunities for partners and projects to advance CSL’s
vision. For example, South Pole’s efforts to establish a fund to incentivize low-carbon farming practices in production landscapes. This collaborative spirit, alongside the input and refinement of the working groups’ recommendations for actions, not only established a strong path forward for CSL, but also clarified roles and expectations for all stakeholders.

Participants reaffirmed the value of collective action to strengthen livelihoods and improve economic well-being of communities in a sustainable manner. They also noted the importance of considering sustainable development pathways that not only include multiple crops and farming systems, but that look beyond producers to also include laborers and related stakeholders, as well as looking beyond agriculture to include opportunities in other sectors, such as tourism. Participants offered constructive feedback on the proposed governance structure for CSL and supported the notion of providing flexibility to district initiatives that meet certain minimum requirements related to process, participation and monitoring. In addition, participants discussed the proposed membership model for CSL, which aims to enable broad participation and engagement. Of note, CSL is not an initiative of any one organization, but rather CSL belongs to all relevant stakeholders of Aceh and North Sumatra – governments, private sector representatives, civil society organizations and farming communities.

While page 7 summarizes further conclusions from the workshop; fundamentally, the workshop successfully brought together numerous stakeholders, representing various sectors, to discuss and agree upon shared objectives and activities for CSL. Ultimately, the workshop concluded with two positive outcomes: the strengthening of CSL’s role to convene stakeholders to support development of jurisdictional plans, and CSL’s position as a place-based platform driving collective action and investment to implement those plans.

Partners supporting the continuation of CSL’s growth, the establishment and implementation of working groups, and the second workshop include Barry Callebaut, Conservation International (CI), Danone, Earthworm Foundation (formerly The Forest Trust), The Livelihoods Fund, Mars Wrigley Confectionary, Mondelēz International, PepsiCo, The Sustainable Trade Initiative (IDH), Walmart Foundation, Unilever and the United Nations Development Program (UNDP). By working collectively with governments to demonstrate positive landscape transformation, CSL can continue to shape encouraging narratives and drive positive impact for sustainable livelihoods within Aceh and North Sumatra.

CSL BACKGROUND

The Indonesian provinces of Aceh and North Sumatra are important production regions for key commodities such as palm oil, rubber, cocoa, coffee and timber – supporting thousands of smallholder farmers and representing a critical component of the regional and national economies of Indonesia. In addition, both provinces contain significant areas of natural forest, providing a home to threatened species as well as securing essential ecosystem services important to human well-being and in managing the climate. The importance of this region has spurred numerous government, private sector and civil society programs aimed at advancing the economic, social and environmental sustainability of both provinces. Although many of these initiatives have achieved important successes, gaps remain and further alignment is required to reach desired impacts.

CSL’s initial supporting partners believed an approach integrating the economic, social and environmental context of a specific district or province would continue to drive economic development and improve natural resources management; help achieve the common objectives shared by government, civil society and private sector; and address inconsistencies or remaining challenges resulting from disparate initiatives. They also recognized that successfully implementing an integrated landscape initiative requires alignment across multiple sets of actors and activities. Thus, they convened an initial workshop in September 2018 in Medan, Indonesia, to test the assumptions behind CSL, assess stakeholder interest in building such an initiative, and identify a path forward for collective action.

During the first workshop, numerous participants from various sectors expressed understanding, and support for, CSL’s approach to drive collective action, in order to facilitate desired impact, scale and longevity of investments. Participants also noted their interest and willingness to work
together towards driving common objectives to achieve real and measurable progress in identified places – indicating collective support for CSL. In addition, participants at the first workshop identified key steps for moving forward, including the establishment of working groups to further define CSL’s approach, at an initiative level and within districts and/or landscapes, and the need to reconvene for a second workshop in 2019. Please visit www.conservation.org/CSL for additional information on the first workshop.

After the first workshop, the CSL established five working groups and began planning to reconvene stakeholders for a second workshop. Each working group had a question that guided their discussions, as follows:

1. **Governance**: What is the CSL governance model and how do interested organizations participate?
2. **Growth**: How will CSL grow and expand beyond the initial regency level pilots?
3. **Metrics**: How will CSL define success?
4. **Aceh Tamiang**: What is Aceh Tamiang’s specific action plan?
5. **Tapanuli Selatan**: What is Tapanuli Selatan’s specific action plan?

During the second workshop, the working groups presented their recommendations for action and investment for discussion and refinement. Once updated, these will be integrated into the CSL systems for operating as appropriate.

The process noted above, in addition to the existing work leveraged within each district or landscape, has formalized CSL as a jurisdictional initiative driving collective action and investment for the advancement of shared goals from government, private sector and civil society to drive livelihood gains for communities, contribute to economic development and improve natural resource management.

As an initiative, CSL convenes stakeholders from across sectors to focus on the advancement of shared goals and government-endorsed sustainable development plans in Aceh and North Sumatra. To achieve alignment and drive collective action, the CSL coordinates targeted engagement and specific activities across three levels – CSL initiative, provincial, and district and/or landscapes. At the initiative level, CSL links supply chains to production areas, sustainable practices and end users. At both the provincial and district levels, CSL provides a space for alignment, learning and investment to encourage the development and implementation of jurisdictional sustainable development plans such as FoKSB! Action Plans for Sustainable Palm Oil and the Green Aceh Initiative. Finally, also at the district and/or landscape level, CSL strengthens existing or develops new integrated landscape initiatives to implement government-supported sustainable development plans.
THE WORKSHOP

Workshop Objective

To achieve its primary objective, the workshop used participatory sessions to refine and align stakeholders on recommended actions and next steps for CSL and to identify clear roles and responsibilities across all stakeholders. This generated a greater sense of clarity for CSL’s activities while also establishing collective responsibility and ownership for CSL to succeed and achieve impact at scale.

Workshop Structure

The design of the two-day workshop focused on three elements: (1) to feature and further expand upon the existing sustainable development activities in Aceh and North Sumatra, (2) to present each working group’s set of recommendations for action, and (3) to allow stakeholders’ to express concerns, priorities and resulting shared opportunities. The workshop included a variety of programming, including panel discussions and keynote speeches to allow the sharing of diverse perspectives as well as common priorities; and breakout sessions to allow all participants an opportunity to provide input. In addition, the use of the Slido software throughout the workshop allowed participants to answer questions posted on two large screens using their mobile phone, which created a fun and interactive dynamic for particular discussions.

Overview of Key Workshop Conclusions

Several key messages and conclusions emerged during workshop discussions:

1. The workshop achieved its primary objective, with over 130 people coming together to discuss and agree upon shared objectives and activities for CSL. In addition, the workshop produced two significant outcomes. First, the workshop strengthened CSL’s role in bringing stakeholders together to support the development and implementation of jurisdictional plans. Second, the workshop solidified CSL’s purpose as a place-based platform driving collective action to advance shared goals.
2. During the workshop, all participants reviewed and supported CSL’s draft vision and mission.
   • **Vision:** By 2030, communities and farmers in Aceh and North Sumatra are thriving, natural resources are well-managed, economies are delivering sustained and equitable benefits, and appropriate governance systems are in place to support continuous improvement.
   • **Mission:** CSL aims to align initiatives, financing opportunities and local, governmental and market interests to collectively drive livelihood gains for farming communities, economic development and improved natural resource management. CSL efforts are focused in Aceh and North Sumatra and are developed with partners and processes aimed at enabling replication as appropriate.

3. Although CSL activities revolve heavily around agriculture, CSL’s fundamental focus on properly managing natural ecosystems, upon which communities, farming and other economic pursuits rely upon, underscores CSL’s mission to drive sustained positive impacts for livelihoods.

4. CSL is a multi-commodity initiative. Palm oil provides an initial starting point for collaboration and district-level sustainability initiatives but CSL intends to contribute to broader sustainable development and benefit a wider range of stakeholders.

5. CSL does not belong to one organization or entity, but is a coalescing of diverse local, provincial, national and international stakeholders with a common vision for sustainable livelihoods through the utilization of government-supported sustainable development plans.

6. As a unifying platform, CSL coordinates and encourages collaboration between different landscape initiatives and actors in Aceh and North Sumatra.

7. Human well-being and environmental conservation and restoration are not mutually exclusive. To address both topics, CSL uses an integrated landscape approach within the district initiatives.

8. With CSL still early in development, current district initiatives should remain the focus. However, identifying opportunities to grow into other districts or landscapes, while remaining cautious to not expand beyond current abilities and capacity, is also important.

9. The proposed governance model provides structure, to promote consistency and integrity, across the levels in which CSL operates. It also ensures flexibility to promote individuality and scaling, for district and landscape initiatives to define stakeholder management systems reflective of their situation. At a minimum, however, district initiatives should include a multi-stakeholder platform aimed at developing and implementing jurisdictional development plans inclusive of monitoring frameworks.

10. To measure success and drive impact, the CSL must ensure alignment and collaboration amongst the district and provincial level activities, as well as to the CSL initiative level.

**Summary of Identified Next Steps**

Identified activities for advancing CSL into its next phase of implementation:

- Update each working groups’ recommendations based on participant feedback.
- Write and distribute workshop report to all participants, inclusive of resources and materials relevant to the workshop.
- Incorporate working groups’ recommendations and key outcomes from the 2019 workshop (Phase 2 outcomes) into a Phase 3 workplan and budget. Phase 3 will focus on the implementation of activities across all operating levels: CSL initiative, provincial, and district or landscape. Examples of specific activities include:
  - In partnership with national and subnational government, continue implementation of each district initiative’s work as captured in each district’s working group. For example, in Aceh Tamiang, developing and establishing robust information and monitoring systems, increasing sustainable palm oil volumes and farmer capacity through Good Agricultural Practices (GAP) and Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil (ISPO) trainings, and further developing and refining the structure, framework and financing model required to operationalize the PUPL (Pusat Unggulan Perkebunan Lestari) and PUKP (Pusat Unggulan Komoditas Berkelanjutan - Center of Excellence). Activities in Tapanuli Selatan include providing technical assistance and support on policy development for District Strategic Area Development Plans (plans integrating landscape protection, restoration, production and infrastructure development), building capacity of 1,000 smallholder farmers through GAP trainings and RSPO/ISPO certification by 2022 and 100% (~6,000) by 2028, training government extension officers, restoring 1,000 hectares of encroached forest through the social forestry scheme.
by 2024, and coordinating with government to improve capacity of Forest Management Units (FMU) to promote forest integrity and resiliency. (see links in appendix 3 below for the full recommended Action and Investment plans for Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan)

- Formalize the membership structure by further detailing and refining the requirements to join or participate, associated benefits and costs, etc. Publish final framework on CSL's webpage/website and begin implementation of membership structure.
- Establish the governance structure by developing terms of references and/or job descriptions for the CSL Advisory Council, CSL Secretariat, and each of the District Initiative Advisory Groups and begin recruiting participants and/or individuals to fill specific roles.
- Recruit and hire staff to lead locally, including a CSL Lead, District Coordinators (one for each district initiative), Provincial Directors (one for each province), etc.
- Further develop and refine CSL's metrics to measure progress and communicate impact.
- Fundraise for, and begin implementation of, the Phase 3 workplan.
- Establish a communications hub to serve as a central resource for CSL partners and to provide information to support knowledge and awareness building for interested participants and the public in general.
- Lead continuous efforts to grow CSL membership and participation and to support internal alignment and coordination.

Summary of Feedback on Working Groups’ Recommendations

General

1. Specifics related to CSL membership and joining requirements needs further definition and clarification;
2. Suggest further documentation and dissemination of CSL processes and learnings for knowledge sharing to benefit similar current, and future, initiatives;
3. Shifting the focus to impact could benefit how CSL measures success;
4. Regular information exchange between Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan is important;
5. Suggest greater clarity on key definitions, for example what ‘sustainable’ means in relation to each commodity.

CSL Governance

6. An important next step will be to detail clear scopes of work for the identified groups and roles within the governance structure (district coordinator, advisory groups, etc.);
7. The CSL Secretariat should have the authority to coordinate all CSL stakeholders;
8. The physical location of the CSL secretariat (and identified roles within the Secretariat) must be strategic for both Aceh and North Sumatra;
9. More clarity is required on the connection between District Level Advisory and CSL Advisory Council;
10. Need for greater understanding of CSL's funding and how funding will be allocated;
11. It is important for trade unions, farmer groups, and NGOs to be involved in the CSL governance structure;
12. Potential benefit to establishing CSL as a legal Indonesian entity for government dealings and formalities.

CSL Growth

13. Continuous stakeholder engagement is important for managing expectations of potential districts for growth;
14. Within the stakeholder engagement processes, it is important to include local communities, domestic companies, and domestic consumers in the analysis of growth districts;
15. Clarity needed on CSL’s specific plan and timeline for growth;
16. Suggest growth look at economic potential within and outside the agricultural sector;
17. Suggest including a mapping of facilities and infrastructure to support the provision of public services and community economic activities as well as to promote more effective uptake and longevity of impacts managed by local actors;
18. A report of Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan ‘tangible’ results for 2020 would help potential future districts in understanding the value of CSL.
CSL Metrics

19. Important for CSL to set clear short-term and long-term targets in measurement;
20. Collecting baseline data for CSL is important;
21. Suggest measuring impact as indication of success. Example: rather than number of farmers trained, measuring the level of farmer adoption;
22. Important to include indicators related to the community and labor;
23. Beneficial to harmonize CSL metrics with government metrics and the Sustainable Development Goals;
24. Suggest identification of currently certified areas as well as which areas have the potential for certification;
25. Beneficial for landscape level indicators to relate to sustainable production as well as carbon measurements;
26. Suggest development of an indicator on deforestation, not only restoration and land change;
27. Suggest metrics being further divided by commodity along with commodity specific certification indicators;
28. Important to spend additional time and resources on further developing and refining a metrics framework prior to finalization and adoption by CSL.

Aceh Tamiang

29. Suggest including coastal areas in the action plans;
30. Utilizing social media could establish greater reach;
31. Need for clarification of PUPL (Center of Excellence) activities;
32. Important to include mitigation of animal conflicts, development of biodiversity corridors, and associated mangrove area degradation in the plans;
33. Important to include community and laborers in the scope of actors;
34. There is a need for activities related to increasing farmers’ technical capacity, such as good agricultural practice (GAP) training and social forestry;
35. PUPL (center of excellence) needs clear work procedures, monitoring systems and reporting systems;
36. Important for indicators of success to go beyond increased productivity as increasing sustainable palm oil is not enough for sustainable livelihoods;
37. Suggest for the activities in Aceh Tamiang to involve ecotourism as well as multiple commodities, including non-timber forest products (NTFPs), rubber, and coffee.

Tapanuli Selatan

38. Beneficial for action plans to accommodate multiple commodities such as NTFPs, rubber and coffee;
39. Suggest incorporating wider communities in Tapanuli Selatan, and not only the farmers within action plans;
40. Suggest including the mitigation of animal conflicts and the construction of biodiversity corridors;
41. Suggest seeking a village regulation for conservation efforts;
42. Suggest developing a special database related to sustainable commodities and zoning;
43. Important for plans to further integrate with local government planning, such as the FoKSBI platform, as well as market linkages;
44. Beneficial for activities to be carried out related to the legality of farmers’ land, standardization, farmers’ business models and agroforestry;
45. Important to include local CSOs in the implementers of the Tapanuli Selatan plans;
46. Need to agree upon, and articulate, clear goals and a monitoring and evaluation framework for Tapanuli Selatan.
Overview of Workshop: Day 1 and Day 2

Workshop Day 1

The focus of the first day was to understand the opportunities for CSL from the perspective of the private sector, government, and civil society, and to align on collective priorities for CSL during further development and implementation. To facilitate this, sessions included panel discussions featuring input from government and private sector as well as specific sessions to hear presentations by, and review the recommendations from, the Governance Working Group and the Metrics Working Group. Emerging from the first day’s panels and speeches from both national and provincial government and the private sector representatives, was the mutual desire and support for economic development, prosperity of farming communities, and positive impact on the livelihoods for all Indonesians. The various national and provincial government representatives gave workshop participants a glimpse of projects on the ground and the potential of communities to achieve conservation, restoration and economic goals. Likewise, the various private sector representatives gave workshop participants an understanding of market needs and the multitude of endeavors currently being supported in Aceh and North Sumatra to reach sustainability goals. Working Group discussions began with a member of the working group giving a brief presentation on the Group’s process, key discussion points, and identified recommendations. Participants then broke into smaller, facilitated, groups to further review, and provide comments and input for refinement, the draft recommendations for action and investment.

Top 5 insights from Workshop Day 1:
1. Greater clarity and understanding for the proposed CSL governance structure, the roles of stakeholders within the structure, and how CSL will function as a multi-scale initiative;
2. Particular concerns of the private sector, such as independent monitoring systems, transparent reporting, and verification of data;
3. The need for integration of existing initiatives, both at the provincial and district levels, including institutional measurement and reporting;
4. CSL’s priority goes beyond smallholders and into the community;
5. Indications of success transitioning from measurements of outputs to impact.
I. Welcome address
   • Ketut S Putra, Vice President of Conservation International Indonesia shared the need for holistic and collective solutions, noting the strength that emerges from government, private sector and civil society working together in harmony for economic and environmental objectives.

II. Keynote speech by Hj Musa Rajekshah, Vice Governor of North Sumatra
   • The Vice Governor addressed the need for overcoming the false assumption that conservation and development are at odds, highlighting that conservation needs must align with the economic welfare of communities. He also noted the urgency of instilling a love for nature and the environment in the younger generation.

III. Opening address by central government representatives Mamat Rahmat, Ditjen Konservasi Sumber Daya Alam Ekosistem (KSDAE) and Ersa Herwinda, Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional (Bappenas)
   • Mahmat Rahmat shared CSL is aligned with the vision and mission of the Sub Directorate of Ecosystem Recovery Conservation Area while also noting conversation must include ecology and discussions about local economy, culture, and knowledge. Collaboration amongst stakeholders, such as the CSL, he added, is key to addressing this need.
   • Ersa Herwinda highlighted the commitments of Indonesia to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and mentioned the importance of all stakeholders’ participation to be built on principles of trust, respect and openness. The National Action Plan of the SDGs and the Regional Action Plan of the SDGs are legal instruments to achieve Indonesia’s commitments. To meet the country’s commitments, these plans must be politically supported and be streamlined within local government’s policies and plans.

IV. Sharing a Vision of CSL: Past, Present and Future, John Buchanan, Vice President, Conservation International
   • John Buchanan shared how CSL emerged – from a shared recognition across diverse stakeholders of the great work, but associated limitations to working separately, across both North Sumatra and Aceh. Connecting the various stakeholders would scale efforts, investments, and ultimately drive greater impact and successes for all stakeholders: farmers, communities, governments, and private sector. Livelihoods became the central theme of CSL and, building on the messages from the first CSL workshop, the second workshop would continue to strengthen alignment for supporting livelihoods.

V. Discussion panel: The Vision of CSL: Sustainable Livelihoods
   • Panelists from the national and provincial governments, together with private sector representatives and a representative of the Maju Bersama Farmer Cooperative, shared presentations and discussed how smallholders should be empowered to improve social and economic conditions in their own communities.
   • The Bupati of Aceh Tamiang, Mursil, shared pointed remarks about the need for those who desire a better environment and improved economic conditions to align their actions and words. In relation to livelihoods and income, he noted the importance of clear land tenure and the challenging reality of farming plots growing significantly smaller as they are distributed across family members.
   • Hasmi Lubis, the Head of the North Sumatra Development and Planning Agency pointed out the development investment plan of North Sumatra focuses on tourism and developing rural areas, potentially impacting urban development. He echoed previously expressed concerns for rural communities, noting the struggle caused from not earning enough from one’s land. He invited civil society and the private sector to join the government in finding solutions to these challenges, particularly in 23 villages indicating promise.
   • Julhadi Siregar, of the Maju Bersama Farmer Cooperative, shared insight from the realities of the over 1,000 oil palm farmers his organization represents. He spoke about the farmer capacity building work that the government and Conservation International have been involved in – such as the good agricultural practice (GAP) training for over 700 farmers, increasing government extension workers’ technical capacity, and creating 7 demo-plots as a medium to learn and practice GAP. He provided a
positive example of what can be accomplished when farmers are trained in good agricultural practices, including increased yield and environmental protection skills, and invited the government and civil society to continue to support farmers efforts to improve their own livelihoods.

- Martin Huxtable, of Unilever, shared his company’s vision of making sustainable palm oil the norm, and their concrete steps within North Sumatra working with thousands of smallholder palm oil farmers. He also noted the importance of collaboration and the need to continue to strengthen the CSL as an initiative to bring the vision of sustainability into reality.

- Olivier Tichit, of Musim Mas, shared insight from the various sustainability and farmer development programs they support, noting the essential role of government in supporting smallholder farmers and farming communities. He also expressed the desire to cooperate more closely with government to scale technical trainings through government systems while emphasizing the importance of the CSL in building deeper relationships amongst stakeholders.

VI. Discussion panel: Brief Overview of Market Needs for Sustainable Commodities Relevant to North Sumatra and Aceh

- A panel of private sector buyer representatives, including Jonathan Horrell of Mondelēz International, Charlene Lin of Mars Wrigley Confectionary, Gregory Bardies of Barry Callebaut, and Reuben Blackie of PepsiCo, shared their responsibilities related to purchasing sustainably sourced commodities while also highlighting their work, alongside supply chain and CSO partners, within Aceh and North Sumatra to encourage a sustainable supply of commodities into the future. Representatives noted the importance of the CSL for the private sector as a way to engage with government and local CSOs to better respond to the needs and opportunities for collaboration emerging on the ground.

- A key message of the private sector representatives was the crucial need for government participation and collaboration. With clear government engagement, programs and activities can be aligned to supporting the development and implementation of government-led sustainable development action plans within a given district. Crucially, the conversation between the private sector and government must lead to added value for local peoples.

- The prospect of employing the landscape approach within a larger jurisdictional initiative, which is central to the CSL strategy, is a great opportunity for the private sector, government, and local communities to collectively advance sustainable agricultural practices. In addition, private sector representatives shared their support for credible reporting and monitoring, indications of progressive positive social and environmental impact, and transparency as key to an integrated sustainable landscape approach.

- Private sector representatives noted the challenge and impact of negative messaging around palm oil in certain markets for both producers, smallholders included, and end users. The opportunity, however, is in local stakeholders working together to shape encouraging stories and narratives by demonstrating positive landscape transformation through working collectively with government. The CSL provides a vehicle for this type of constructive collaboration.

VII. Overview of CSL Working Groups and Process

- Background to the development and implementation of CSL’s five working groups, arising from the first CSL workshop, was shared and results of those working groups – drafted recommendations for action and investment – would be the focus of discussions for the workshop.

VIII. Brief comments from representatives of working groups

- Representatives from each of the working groups shared information related to the processes of discussions and the drafting of documents, noting the working group meetings provided space to explore the future of the CSL as well as the opportunities for further development in the district landscape projects of Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan.

IX. Presentation and discussion: CSL Governance and Metrics Working Groups’ Recommendations

- A member of the CSL Governance Working Group shared the group’s recognition of needing to develop a structure which accommodated CSL’s work across the global supply chain, provincial, district and landscape levels. The structure proposed for CSL governance requires CSL at the broader initiative
level to be governed as a network with each district or landscape level to be governed separately while using similar structures to drive cohesion while accommodating for varying differences across landscapes. Finally, links between the broader CSL initiative and the district and landscape level work are provided through key staff positions, as identified in the recommended roles for hiring. The proposed membership structure would be open for wide participation from across stakeholders however would specifically identify between formal members, who have membership responsibilities and related benefits, and participants, who have less responsibilities but also limited access to benefits.

- A member of the CSL Metrics Working Group shared the group’s main objective was to consider how CSL would measure success. The working group members agreed the focus of indicators would be on economy (inclusive of human well-being), environment and governance, consistent with the emerging vision statement for CSL. In addition, leveraging linkages between current metrics and frameworks, such as government indicators, SDGs, etc. was an important consideration of the group. Finally, it was also agreed the purpose of the proposed CSL metrics framework was not to duplicate what is already being done at landscape, project, or certification levels but is intended to be adapted as necessary over time in order to adequately represent the agreed upon desired impacts.

- After presentations by members of the Governance and Metrics Working Groups, workshop participants separated into eight small groups, each with a facilitator, to analyze and provide input for refinement for each working group’s drafted recommendations for action and investment. The small groups then presented their findings to the larger workshop, allowing time for questions and additional comments, leading to enthusiastic conversations amongst all participants as well as a productive input sharing session for each working group’s action plan. A summary of recommendations arising from these discussions is provided above in the Summary of Recommendations for Working Groups section of this report.

X. Plenary Discussion: Implementing the Working Group Recommendations

- Following these discussions from the first day, workshop participants explored potential steps required, and actual feasibility, for the implementation of the recommended actions.

Workshop Day 2

The focus of the second day was to consider CSL’s work at the district level, particularly within the initial district initiatives of Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan. After an opening panel which presented the sustainable development work within Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan over the last year, breakout sessions were held to analyze and refine each district initiative’s drafted recommendations for action and investment.

Day 1 – Example of Slido poll question and top responses from workshop participants

When you read a newspaper in 2030 and an article for CSL is written, what headline would you want to see for what you have achieved?

1. CSL reduced poverty by 40%
2. Better forests, better water supply
3. No forest fires
4. Ecosystem saved thanks to CSL
5. Sustainable investment model is implemented in Indonesia
6. No deforestation, sustainable production
7. CSL wraps up after completing all of its objectives
I. Presentation and Discussion: How is CSL Implemented in Aceh and North Sumatra?

- Representatives from the Bupati of Aceh Tamiang and the Bupati of Tapanuli Selatan shared their commitment to achieving sustainability amongst all farmers in the districts. Yunus, of the Agency of Agriculture, Plantations, and Farmers in Aceh Tamiang shared the government’s desire to establish Aceh Tamiang as an example of sustainable development progress for all districts. Farmers have learned from past mistakes and are open to learning new methods and approaches. The Bupati of Aceh Tamiang is ready to support the sustainability of oil palm and in doing so requires technical support for water sourcing issues and infrastructure development. He noted the Center of Excellence in Aceh Tamiang was established by the government and is a key aspect of the Aceh Tamiang Working Group’s recommendations for action and investment. The aim of the Center of Excellence is to bring together NGOs, farmer communities, and the government in order to support sustainable production and environmental preservation. The district government is also working towards improved integrated monitoring systems and forest restoration, as well as making the legality of land easier to establish. The Center of Excellence will assist in achieving these aims from the government.

- Abadi, the Head of Bappeda in Tapanuli Selatan, highlighted the government’s aims to achieve its policy for spatial planning management and regulating activities in the district towards environmental responsibility. The government also sees potential for Lake Toba tourism and invites NGOs and the private sector to participate in its plans. Nassat Idris, of Conservation International, highlighted the government’s District Sustainable Palm Oil Action Plan – which was built using a multistakeholder process focused on mainstreaming landscape approaches – has been incorporated into the Tapanuli Selatan Working Group’s recommendations for action and investment. He also noted the need for increasing technical capacities of farmers and raising awareness for alignment between production and conservation. In fact, agroforestry is being considered as a means towards alternative livelihoods and the protection of forests, ensuring conservation together with the well-being of communities.

II. Discussion: Implementing the Working Group Recommendations in Aceh and North Sumatra

- Zakki Hakim, of IDH, shared background on IDH’s work in Aceh Tamiang with farmers, farming communities, and in enabling farmers to access capital, reduce deforestation, and increase equality. He shared the vision of multistakeholder platforms at the local level to ensure the ability for plans to be coordinated and developed at both the provincial and local levels. Within Aceh, IDH is working towards a verified sourcing area.

- Arief Perkasa, of Earthworm Foundation, shared about Earthworm’s efforts in Aceh Tamiang, with a specific look at community well-being and poverty’s link to driving deforestation. Programs have been empowering women to become farmers, specifically planting vegetables and fruits, to encourage increased family income and opportunity as well as prevent further encroachment by communities in need. Education is also a key area of focus with curriculum aimed at empowering students to find alternative income and engage in conservation and restoration activities being utilized in schools.

Top 5 Insights from Day 2:

1. CSL is a multi-commodity platform. Palm oil is the current focus and ‘entry point’ for Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan due to the urgent needs of conservation;
2. Suggest documentation related to the process of developing CSL and disseminating across district, provincial, and national levels;
3. Institutional support at the district and provincial level is essential for execution of CSL related activities;
4. Diversified income at the district level is a concern for stakeholders – with ecotourism and agroforestry as potential models for alternative livelihoods;
5. The scope of CSL participation is “CSL is for all”.

Following the previous sessions, workshop participants divided into eight small groups, led by a small group facilitator, to review and provide input for refinement on the drafted recommendations for action and investment from each district initiative’s working group. A summary of recommendations...
emerging from these discussions is provided above in the Summary of Recommendations for Working Groups section of this report.

III. Presentation and Discussion: How will CSL Expand in Aceh and North Sumatra? A look at the CSL Growth Working Group’s recommended action and investment plan and an overview of available data in priority districts.

- A CSL Growth Working Group Member shared how the group approached determining a process for CSL to use when considering growth into other landscapes or districts. The suggested process includes comprehensive data gathering and summary report, stakeholder engagement and communications plan, and clear recommendations for the CSL Advisory Council. Furthermore, future areas should align with existing government programs or policies as this is a key element of CSL’s programs.

For example, expansion to additional districts in North Sumatra could leverage and link to the FoKSBI platform for sustainable palm oil, which further aligns with the National Action Plan. The working group discussed criteria for expansion to a new district should include, but not be limited to, environment, economic, and human well-being elements existing within the district. Through further discussion, the wider workshop participants agreed there should be a baseline requirement for a district to be involved in CSL, such as having at minimum a multi-stakeholder process or forum already established, government engagement and commitment, and the development of a clear action plan inclusive of a monitoring and evaluation system. However, any requirements must also carefully be defined as it is important to not becomes exclusive or burdensome for interested districts to engage and participate.
and North Sumatra were shared with workshop participants which led to a comprehensive discussion of both the need for CSL to expand beyond the initial districts of Aceh Tamiang and Tapanuli Selatan as well as the importance of involving local stakeholders in potential districts, documenting key learnings from the current districts, and not waiting too long to move into new districts.

• After both presentations, workshop participants divided into small groups, each with a facilitator, to analyze and provide input for refinement on the recommendations for action and investment. This led to enthusiastic conversations from all participants as well as helpful input on the improvement of the group’s recommendations. A summary of recommendations emerging from these discussions is provided above in the Summary of Recommendations for Working Groups section of this report.

IV. Growing CSL: A Shared Opportunity and Responsibility

• Workshop participants completed the workshop by considering the next steps for CSL as it moves into its next phase. Participants agreed on the key next step for moving forward — revising, and then implementing, each Working Group’s recommendations for action and investment. A Slido poll of participants helped to consider who must carry out what responsibility going forward for CSL and the responses are written below.

V. Closing remarks from founding members of CSL

• Representatives of Earthworm, IDH, UNDP, CI, and Mars shared reflections on the development of CSL, emphasizing their excitement that CSL is growing and becoming more established as an initiative. While the understanding for CSL was less clear during the initial development stages, something common to all new initiatives, it was clear that the 2019 workshop provided clarity and structure to the road ahead while lending reinforcement to the work already underway in the landscapes. Representatives also emphasized CSL is a collective enterprise with everyone having a role in collaboration, participation, and communication and remarked how impressed they were with the level of ownership emerging with international, national, provincial, and local stakeholders supporting CSL and recognizing its value in achieving common sustainable development objectives where people, nature, and economies are all thriving.

Day 2 – Example of Slido poll question and top responses from workshop participants

What is your role in the development of the CSL in the next 6-12 months?

1. Expand the training of smallholders and working closer with the district government to improve the livelihoods of smallholders
2. Financially support the CSL activities in North Sumatra and Aceh
3. Implement the CSL action and investment plans
4. Take the first step to operationalize the Center of Excellence in Aceh Tamiang
5. Strengthen institutional capacity
6. Make stuff happen!
7. Support reforestation efforts in Tapanuli Selatan and Aceh Tamiang involving communities and local stakeholders
8. Increase awareness and investment in programs that support smallholders, communities and the local government to increase sustainability
## Appendix 1: Workshop Agenda

**Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods**  
**Phase 2 Planning and Design Workshop**  
**October 30-31, 2019**

Santika Premiere Dyandra Hotel & Convention – Medan, Indonesia

### Day 1

**Objective:** To align stakeholders on the vision of CSL and present recommended draft action and investment plans for deliberation.

**Target Outcome:** To finalize recommended draft action and investment plans by theme and foster collective ownership of the plans in order to have clear actionable steps for CSL into the future.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:00 – 9:00</td>
<td>Registration and Networking Coffee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00 – 9:10</td>
<td>Welcome Address by CSL Representative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:10 – 10:00</td>
<td>Opening Address by Guests of Honor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 – 10:10</td>
<td>Sharing a Vision of the Past, Present, and Future of CSL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:10 – 11:30</td>
<td>Opening Discussion Panel – The Vision of CSL: Sustainable Livelihoods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30 – 12:30</td>
<td>Discussion Panel – Brief Overview of Market Needs for Sustainable Commodities Relevant to Aceh &amp; North Sumatra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30 – 12:45</td>
<td>Press Response Session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30 – 14:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00 – 14:45</td>
<td>CSL Working Group &amp; Process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 14:45 – 16:00 | Deep-Dive: Presentation & Discussion  
CSL Governance & Metrics Working Groups’ Recommendations |
| 16:00 – 16:30 | Coffee Break & Continued small group discussions                         |
| 16:30 – 17:30 | Plenary Discussion: Implementing the Working Group Recommendations – Bringing It All Together |
| 17:30 – 17:45 | Day 1 Closing Remarks                                                   |
| 17:45 – 18:45 | Optional Side Event – Unlocking Private Finance through the Aceh / North Sumatra Landscape Carbon Fund, Led by South Pole |

Mars and South Pole have partnered to facilitate the creation of a fund to support livelihoods through carbon finance, this session will present the vision and will serve as an initial consultation.
Day 2

Objective: To align stakeholders on the vision of CSL at the provincial level and present recommended draft action and investment plans for deliberation.

Target Outcome: To have a clear set of roles and responsibilities for each stakeholder group, with specific stakeholders agreeing in principle to carry out specific actions to advance CSL.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:00 – 9:00</td>
<td>Networking Coffee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00 – 9:15</td>
<td>Welcome and Recap of Day 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:15 – 9:45</td>
<td>Keynote Address</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:45 – 11:00</td>
<td>Networking Coffee Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 – 12:00</td>
<td>Discussion: Implementing the Working Group Recommendations in Aceh &amp; North Sumatra – Bringing It All Together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00 – 13:30</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00 – 15:30</td>
<td>Networking Coffee Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:45 – 16:00</td>
<td>CSL Phase 2: Summary of All Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00 – 17:00</td>
<td>Facilitated Closing Discussion: CSL Phase 2, Growing CSL: A Shared Opportunity &amp; Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00 – 17:30</td>
<td>Closing Remarks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2: List of Participating Organizations

- Aceh Green Community/Forum DAS Krueng Peusangan
- Aceh Tamiang Government: BAPPEDA Kabupaten Aceh Tamiang
- ANJ
- Apical
- Bakrie
- Bappeda Province Sumatera Utara
- Bappeda Tapsel
- Barry Callebaut
- CI
- COE Aceh Tamiang
- Dinas Disperindag
- Dinas Kehutanan (Forestry Service)
- Dinas Perkebunan Prov. Sumut
- Dinas Pertanian Perkebunan dan Peternakan
- Dinas Sumber Daya Air Cipta Karya & Tata Ruang Sumut
- Disbun SU
- DLH
- Earthworm
- Forum Konservasi Leuser (FKL)
- IDH
- IFC
- IKEI Sumut
- Kempra
- KLHK Jakarta
- Koompasia Enviro Institute
- KTNA Aceh Tamiang
- Lestari Capital
- Louis Dreyfus Company
- LTKL
- Maju Bersama (TapSel Farmer Cooperative)
- Mars
- Mondelez
- Musim Mas
- OIC
- OPPUK
- P&G
- Pak Pak Bharat- Medan: Bupati
- Pepsico
- Perkebunan (Crop Estate Agency North Sumatra)
- Proforest
- PT Indo Cafco-Ecom Group
- PT Mopoli Raya
- PT SAS
- PT. London Sumatera
- PT. Permata Hijau Sawit
- PT. SINTONG ABADI
- PUPR Tapsel
- Pusat Penelitian Kelapa Sawit
- SERBUNDO
- South Pole
- Starling Resources
- Tapanuli Selatan Planning Agency/Bappeda
- UNDP
- UNDP-SPOI/FOKSBI
- Unilever
- University Malaya
- University of North Sumatra
- Walhi Sumut
- Yagasu
- Yayasan Pelatuk Indonesia
- YEL
Appendix 3: Overview of 2019 CSL Working Groups & Recommended Action and Investment Plans

Below is a summary of each Working Group’s discussion, which was shared and discussed during the 2019 workshop, as well as links to the recommended plans for action and investment.

Governance
The Group’s Guiding Question: What is the governance model and how do interested organizations participate?

The Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods’ Governance Working Group met over four sessions between August and October 2019 in order to address the question of how CSL would develop a governance structure into the next phase of its development and how the membership structure would be open enough for all to participate, yet robust enough to efficiently and effectively support CSL landscapes towards achieving sustainability objectives. Between each session, working group members contributed to the creation of collective working group documents in order to aid discussions and provide a clear approach to creating a CSL governance structure. The working group considered best practices from other landscape and jurisdictional approaches from across different regions and, in doing so, recognized the importance for a model with both a structure to encourage integrity as well as flexibility to promote scaling beyond the initial landscape level initiatives. Further supporting conclusions drawn during the first CSL workshop, the group also agreed the governance structure must be flexible enough to reflect realities at the initiative level, yet clear and formalized enough to ensure the integrity of the CSL. Thus, in an effort to achieve this difficult balance, the working group recommended a structure to support consistency and collaboration across each of CSL’s main areas of operation and engagement (initiative, provincial, district, landscape) and proposes for CSL governance to primarily focus on governing the CSL member network while providing flexibility for the districts to shape and define the direction of their specific projects. All CSL members will, however, adhere to certain guiding principles, reporting structures, and communications procedures agreed by all.

Click the following link to access the detailed governance plan with recommendations, timelines and targets: CSL Governance Working Group Recommended Action and Investment Plan

Growth
The Group’s Guiding Question: How will CSL grow and expand beyond the initial regency level pilots?

The Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods’ Growth Working Group met over three sessions between August and October 2019 in order to address the question of how CSL would scale beyond the initial districts of Tapanuli Selatan in North Sumatra Province, and Aceh Tamiang in Aceh Province. Between each session, working group members contributed to the creation of collective working group documents in order to aid their discussions and provide structure to the process of how new districts would be identified. In doing so, the group considered CSL’s potential to scale beyond the initial district initiatives (Tapanuli Selatan and Aceh Tamiang) to additional districts within the provinces of Aceh and North Sumatra. However, the group also fully recognized the importance and need for CSL to continue to focus on initial implementation and the resulting learnings from these first two district initiatives within CSL. A key document that emerged during discussions was an outline of essential criteria for determining where to grow. Another milestone was the translation of this criteria into a broad process for determining the potential of a district under consideration. These discussions led to the development of recommended actions for CSL to take into its next phase of development as well as the development of a process map which outlines an approach to data gathering and determining key new districts for CSL.

Click the following link to access the detailed growth plan with recommendations, timelines and targets: CSL Growth Working Group Recommended Action and Investment Plan

Metrics
The Group’s Guiding Question: How will CSL define success and what are the most effective ways to measure progress?

The Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods’ Metrics Working Group met over four sessions between August and October 2019 in order to address the question of how CSL would define success and what ways were most effective to
measure CSL progress. Between each session, working group members contributed to the creation of collective working group documents in order to aid their discussions and provide structure to the metrics framework being conceptualized. The group considered the vision of CSL and noted the emphasis on sustainable livelihoods could specifically be categorized into four categories: economic, environmental, human well-being, and governance. Furthermore, the group recognized CSL operates and engages across multiple levels and would need a framework to not only capture impact across these four categories, but also across CSL’s varying operating levels (initiative, provincial and district/landscape). The initiative level focuses on the entirety of the CSL initiative, including the functioning of the membership network. The provincial level concerns the operation of CSL in conjunction with provincial government action plans. The district/landscape level addressed the programs and projects occurring by CSL members towards the CSL vision.

Thus, the group agreed aligning a corresponding metrics framework to represent both the structure and vision of CSL would be essential for effectively measuring progress. The working group considered best practices from other landscape and jurisdictional approaches from across different regions and, using a shared document, began to define metrics and corresponding indicators as well as identifying linkages to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). As progress was made, it was decided the metrics and indicators would need to be further simplified, especially in CSL’s beginning implementation phase. In addition, understanding who was responsible for measurement, management of data, and reporting was important as well as how the data would be used to tell the story of CSL’s impact and success. Given the complexity of capturing metrics with ability to represent the various aspects of how CSL is operating, it was agreed the framework would benefit from further clarification and refinement before adoption.

Click the following link to access the detailed metrics plan with recommendations, timelines and targets: CSL Metrics Working Group Recommended Action and Investment Plan

Aceh Tamiang
The Group’s Guiding Question: What are the specific action plans for CSL’s Aceh Tamiang pilot?

The Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods’ Aceh Tamiang Working Group met twice in person between September and October 2019 in order to address what specific actions, that would emphasize and strengthen the link between existing work within the landscape and CSL’s priorities, should be included within a landscape plan. Key to these activities was leveraging the current strengths of the district, including the strong support from the district government, to continue current and on-going processes, for example: improving technical capacity building for smallholder farmers; improving forest zone protection of the Leuser Ecosystem; developing a Center of Excellence; and the development of a central management body to facilitate community livelihood activities. The Aceh Tamiang pilot also serves as a pilot for the Verified Sourcing Area concept and methodology.

Click the following link to access the detailed Aceh Tamiang plan with recommendations, timelines and targets: CSL Aceh Tamiang Working Group Recommended Action and Investment Plan

Tapanuli Selatan
The Group’s Guiding Question: What are the specific action plans for CSL’s Tapanuli Selatan (Tapsel) pilot?

The Coalition for Sustainable Livelihoods’ Tapanuli Selatan (Tapsel) Working Group met twice in person between August and October 2019 in order to address what specific actions, that would emphasize and strengthen the link between existing work within the landscape and CSL’s priorities, should be included within a landscape plan. Key to these discussions was including activities that would continue to promote the district and provincial level government’s efforts to develop sustainable action roadmaps and plans as well as strengthen farmers’ sustainable practices and access to markets. These discussions led to recommended actions for the district to continue to implement and aim to achieve through leveraging CSL’s broader initiative support.

Click the following link to access the detailed Tapanuli Selatan plan with recommendations, timelines and targets: CSL Tapanuli Selatan Working Group Recommended Action and Investment Plan
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Headline</th>
<th>Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Media</td>
<td>Headline</td>
<td>Link</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Appendix 5: Points of Contact and Links to Learn More**

**Materials and Additional Information**

Email the CSL Network at [CSL@conservation.org](mailto:CSL@conservation.org) or visit [conservation.org/CSL](http://conservation.org/CSL) to learn more.

**Points of Contact:**

**Aceh**
Arief Perkasa, a.perkasa@earthworm.org
Riswan, riswan@idhtrade.org
Zakki Hakim, hakim@idhtrade.org

**North Sumatra**
Nassat Idris, nidris@conservation.org
Bharaty, bharaty@conservation.org

**International**
John Buchanan, jbuchanan@conservation.org
Jessica Furmanski, jfurmanski@conservation.org